

Meeting Minutes

Plan & Zoning Commission Meeting

Tuesday, November 6, 2018

Ankeny City Hall – City Council Chambers

410 W. First Street, Ankeny, Iowa

CALL TO ORDER

Chair T.Ripper called the November 6, 2018 meeting of the Plan & Zoning Commission to order at 6:30 pm.

ROLL CALL

Members present: L.Anderson, T.Flack, C.Ender, G.Hunter, S.Odson, T.Ripper, A.Renaud and L.West. Staff present: E.Jensen, E.Carstens, D.Silverthorn, K.Gorman, R.Hulstrom, B.Fuglsang

AMENDMENTS TO THE AGENDA

G.Hunter requested Item #2, 3405 N Ankeny Boulevard – Natural Health Chiropractic Site Plan be removed from the Consent Agenda. Motion by G.Hunter to approve and accept the November 6, 2018 agenda with the removal of Item #2 from the Consent Agenda. Second by T.Flack. All voted aye. Motion carried 8 – 0.

COMMUNICATIONS

There were no communications.

CITIZEN'S REQUEST

There were no requests.

CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS

Item #1. Minutes

Motion to approve and accept the October 16, 2018 minutes of the Plan and Zoning Commission meeting.

Item #3. 130 NE Georgetown Boulevard – Northpointe Village Center Plat 3, Lot 73 Site Plan

Motion to approve the Northpointe Village Center Plat 3, Lot 73 Site Plan at 130 NE Georgetown Boulevard, subject to City Council approval and recordation of the storm water management facility easement document.

Item #4. 710 SW 3rd Street – Pig 'n Pedal Restaurant Site Plan

Motion to approve the Pig 'n Pedal Restaurant Site Plan at 710 SW 3rd Street, subject to staff approval of the parking area and access to the site.

L.Anderson raised the question whether the Commission is going to consider the exterior insulation and finish system siding, which is on Item #2, Item #3 and Item #4 site plans as a permanent building material.

A.Renaud agreed that the three site plans shown do not have permanent base materials. She asked if this standard will be allowed. E.Carstens stated there is nothing written in the code, so any standard that is set has been set by the Plan and Zoning Commission.

T.Flack asked if there is an example of another building that has this EIFS material. D.Silverthorn mentioned that the Canoyer's Garden Center project did not have EIFS but it was a non-permanent material that was approved.

A.Renaud stated as she drove around she noted other buildings that have EIFS but they have a permanent base with the EIFS above. L.West shared that she would prefer to see a permanent base with the EIFS above on all three of the site plans presented. T.Flack and L.Anderson agreed with L.West.

Karl Chambers, Imprint Architects, 1605 N Ankeny Boulevard, Ankeny stated that they are the architect on all three of the site plan projects presented on the agenda. He stated there is some differences in the projects but the argument to be made on all three of them is that the EIFS industry does have a more permanent material. He stated it is a Panzer 20 fiberglass mesh and shared that it is tested by the American Standard Testing Materials Institute. He stated Panzer 20 is tested for impact resistance and is designed for ground applications. He commented that for Item #2 and Item #3 on the agenda it is purely aesthetic for a more

contemporary look. Karl Chambers stated Item #4, The Pig 'n Pedal project is an existing building with non-insulated walls. He explained the reasoning for utilizing the EIFS on this particular project is that there is condensation and moisture problems so the intent is to move the dew point to the outside of the wall, which moves the moisture outside of the building to prevent mold. Karl Chambers continued to state that EIFS is being used more on contemporary buildings and that is why the industry has developed this product to solve the issue in terms of it being a permanent material. He further explained that typical EIFS fiberglass mesh is similar to a piece of paper with a scratch coat on it. The Panzer 20 with the scratch coat on it is more like chipboard in terms of its thickness and weight. The Panzer 20 meets the ASTM E 2486 Standard. He again shared that the American Standard Testing Materials Institute is a nationally accredited testing lab, which tested this product for impact resistance.

S.Odson provided background information as to the Commission's reasoning for the 24-inch to 36-inch of durable base material. He commented that if this new EIFS would hold up and look nice over time he would not have a problem with it but he does not have confidence that it will. T.Flack asked if there is an example of a project that has used the Panzer 20 fiberglass mesh. Karl Chambers stated the only one he can think of is a building in Ames.

T.Flack commented that one of the site plans provided the grade/quality of EIFS that will be used and asked whether the other two site plans would be using the same. Karl Chambers stated that the Panzer 20 will be used in all three-site plan projects. The Commission agreed that if they would choose to allow this product, there should be a condition placed on each site plan. The Commission discussed further about how durable base materials work in conjunction with the aesthetics of a building after a couple of years, and would like the buildings to maintain their curb appeal. T.Flack commented that she has a hard time approving a project where there is no history on the products durability. Karl Chambers commented that the Panzer 20 is tested, and meets the ASTM E 2486 Standard.

G.Hunter shared that since the material is not against the code, in his opinion, it is hard for the Commission to tell them they cannot use this material without the possibility of a challenge. He stated the Commission should make sure this is addressed as part of the Zoning and Subdivision Code Rewrite. T.Ripper commented that the Commission has not been 100% consistent on this issue. A.Renaud asked if there is another durable material that could be used on the projects to provide the same look. Karl Chambers stated that it could be possible for two of the projects but not on the Pig 'n Pedal.

Referencing Item #4, C.Ender asked how much bike parking has been provided on-site.

Jason Kapela, Owner, Pig 'n Pedal Restaurant, 710 SW 3rd Street, Ankeny stated there will be bike parking along the entire back fence which is away from the building.

There were no further questions from the Commission.

Motion by G.Hunter to approve the recommendations for Consent Agenda Items #1, #3 and #4 and that the Motions for Item #3 and #4 be amended by adding the following words "with the condition that the bottom 36-inches of the building, at a minimum, meet the ASTM E 2486 requirement for an EIFS surfacing."

Item #1. Minutes

Motion to approve and accept the October 16, 2018 minutes of the Plan and Zoning Commission meeting.

Item #3. 130 NE Georgetown Boulevard – Northpointe Village Center Plat 3, Lot 73 Site Plan

Motion to approve the Northpointe Village Center Plat 3, Lot 73 Site Plan at 130 NE Georgetown Boulevard, subject to City Council approval and recordation of the storm water management facility easement document; and with the condition that the bottom 36-inches of the building, at a minimum, meet the ASTM E 2486 requirement for an EIFS surfacing.

Item #4. 710 SW 3rd Street – Pig 'n Pedal Restaurant Site Plan

Motion to approve the Pig 'n Pedal Restaurant Site Plan at 710 SW 3rd Street, subject to staff approval of the parking area and access to the site and with the condition that the bottom 36-inches of the building, at a minimum, meet the ASTM E 2486 requirement for an EIFS surfacing.

Second by L.Anderson. Motion carried 5 – 3. (Nay: T.Flack, S.Odson, L.West)

REMOVED CONSENT AGENDA ITEM

Item #2. 3405 N Ankeny Boulevard – Natural Health Chiropractic Site Plan

G.Hunter shared that he dislikes the look of the building, including the colors. He feels that it looks like a cinder block and stated there is no elevation relief. G.Hunter also stated that he feels there should be the same condition for the EIFS placed on this building too.

L.Anderson shared that he thinks it looks more like the buildings on the north side of 36th Street. He stated other buildings along that stretch of N Ankeny Boulevard are mostly brick, so at least the front façade matches those buildings. He further stated that he does not necessarily have any problem with the way it looks architecturally aside from that he does think the building would benefit aesthetically by having the 24-inch to 36-inch permanent building material along the base of the building.

Karl Chambers stated this building is a very modern concept. T.Ripper asked if they had any additional elevations of the building from what the Commission was provided. D.Silverthorn provided additional elevations for the Commission to review. Karl Chambers went over all the details of the building elevations with the Commission to provide an understanding of how the building will actually present itself when built.

Aaron Bloodsworth, Natural Health Chiropractic, 3405 N Ankeny Boulevard, Ankeny stated there will be landscaping all around the building with shrubs and grasses and explained that all the windows around the building are full storefront windows.

Karl Chambers reiterated that it is a very modern concept and small building. He then presented and reviewed the landscaping plan since it was not represented on the model drawing. T.Flack continued to share her discontent with the EIFS around the building. Aaron Bloodsworth further commented that there would be landscaping rocks around their building so there will not be any mowing or snow equipment up next to the building. He further stated that he has this EIFS material on his home and is pleased with the durability of the product. T.Flack asked what the age of his home was and Aaron Bloodsworth stated he built it four years ago.

C.Ender asked where the HVAC equipment would be located for this building. Karl Chambers stated it will be on the rooftop as there is a 4-foot parapet on the building.

L.Anderson stated if the chiropractic business would ever go away, he feels the building would be a good fit for many different businesses. He further shared that the only issue he has with the building is the east elevation. He suggested that if they would use the same building material that is on the west elevation along the bottom 36-inches of the east and north sides of the building, it might be more aesthetically appealing to the Commission.

Aaron Bloodsworth stated that they worked very hard to make it appear more commercialized versus residential and asked the Commission for their approval to build the building as presented in their design. He stated they have been in Ankeny for six years and would like to keep their business in Ankeny.

T.Flack asked if there will be color in the logo and Aaron Bloodsworth presented the colors of the practice logo. Karl Chambers commented that the color gray is what most clients are asking for. T.Ripper shared that he feels that it does fit with the buildings on 36th Street.

L.Anderson asked what their timeline was for construction on the building. Aaron Bloodsworth stated they would like to begin construction as soon as possible, as they have already experienced delays.

T.Flack stated she still is not comfortable with the EIFS product as a durable base material.

Motion was made by L.Anderson to approve the site plan for 3405 N Ankeny Boulevard, Natural Health Chiropractic with a condition to extend the Centruion stone along the bottom 36-inches of the north and east elevations of the building.

Aaron Bloodsworth then stated that with the extension of the stone, it would put them over budget. He shared that they designed the building to reduce overhead. He asked the Commission if they could stay with the same EIFS material, along the bottom 36-inches around the building so that they can stay within their budget.

C.Ender commented that before there is a second on the Motion, he would not support the Motion. He stated he would support going with the Panzer 20 fiberglass mesh as they have requested. He supported it on the previous projects and he would be in favor of supporting it again on this project.

A.Renaud commented that she would agree with C.Ender. Since some of the standards do not exist in the code today, the Commission should look at this as they move forward with the rewrite of the zoning ordinances. She commented that it is hard not to approve the material on this project since the Commission just approved the material in the previous project. She would encourage additional screening around the north and east sides of the building.

The Commission again reviewed the landscaping plan with Karl Chambers and Aaron Bloodsworth.

L.Anderson withdrew his previous Motion.

Motion by L.Anderson to approve the site plan for 3405 N Ankeny Boulevard, Natural Health Chiropractic and that the Motion be amended by adding the following words "with a condition that the bottom 36-inches of the building, at a minimum, meet the ASTM E 2486 requirement for an EIFS surfacing." Second by A.Renaud. Motion failed 4 – 4. (Nay: T.Flack, G.Hunter, S.Odson, L.West)

G.Hunter stated his concern is with the color of the building. T.Flack agreed.

E.Jensen provided the Commission with a copy of Code Chapter 192.02(3)(B) Site Plan Requirements - Building Design. The Commission further discussed the various designs of the buildings on N Ankeny Boulevard and 36th Street surrounding the proposed project.

Karl Chambers made some recommendations to the Commission to breakup the north and east sides of the building by providing some vertical texture and he also stated he would lighten up one of the gray colors.

Motion by L.West to approve the site plan for 3405 N Ankeny Boulevard, Natural Health Chiropractic and that the Motion be amended by adding the following words "with a condition that the bottom 36-inches of the building, at a minimum, meet the ASTM E 2486 requirement for an EIFS surfacing and the building will feature a vertical design to break up the north and east sides of the building." Second by C.Ender. Motion carried 5 – 3. (Nay: T.Flack, G.Hunter, S.Odson)

PUBLIC HEARINGS

There were no public hearings.

BUSINESS ITEMS

There were no business items.

REPORTS

City Council Meeting

L.West reported on her attendance at the November 5, 2018, City Council meeting.

Director's Report

E.Jensen presented the tentative agenda items for the November 20, 2018 Plan and Zoning Commission meeting and the October 2018 Building Permits Report.

E.Jensen shared with the Commission that there will be a Joint City Council/Plan and Zoning Commission work session on November 12, 2018 at 7:00 p.m. in the City Council Chambers.

Commissioner's Reports

C.Ender shared information from his attendance at the American Planning Association Conference in Council Bluffs, Iowa. He then asked City staff if they had any information to share with the Commission from the conference. E.Jensen and R.Hulstrom shared information from their sessions at the conference.

T.Flack shared that she is looking forward to having the APA Conference somewhere in the metro in 2020.

S.Odson encouraged the Commission to make sure they share their opinions during the Plan and Zoning Commission meeting when considering the projects as presented.

MISCELLANEOUS ITEMS

November 20, 2018 – 5:30 p.m. City Council Meeting Representative: Staff

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 7:43 p.m.



Submitted by Brenda Fuglsang, Secretary
Plan & Zoning Commission